

# Real Examples of MATCH Violations in Anesthesia

Stephen M. Rupp, M.D.  
Virginia Mason Medical Center  
Seattle, Washington

## Real Examples of Match Violations in Anesthesiology

Stephen M. Rupp, MD  
Ted Sanford, MD

### This is solicited membership input:

- Email requesting questions on match
- Requesting clarification of interpretations
- Giving examples of match violation “near-misses” or violations
- Some opinions were received as well

### Perspective Received:

- “Why keep violations anonymous?”
- “If violations were not ‘innocent’ they should be identified”
- “It is not the prerogative of any program to reinterpret the rules”
- “I hope the clear message is that no match violations are acceptable”

### Current Hot topic:

- The post-interview phone call or “love letter”
- Carl Erik Fisher, MD. Manipulation and the Match. JAMA 2009;302(12):1266-1267
- “Program directors should establish transparent communication policies”
- “The best practice would be to inform applicants that post-interview communication does not affect their standing in the program’s ranking”

### “Transfers”

- I have been approached by a current CATEGORICAL Anesthesiology PGY-1 at U <elsewhere> about applying to our ADVANCED program as a CA-1 for July 2010.
- Said trainee claims this would not constitute a Match violation, as he had reported to and began program to which Matched in 2009.
- Is this a subsequent "legal" TRANSFER?
- or is it a violation of a Match to a CATEGORICAL 4-year position?
- Applicant claims consent from PD of U of <elsewhere>...

### Failing Step 2 CS

- Can a program break its commitment to a resident if he/she fails Step 2 CS USMLE and can't graduate on time?

### ERAS and NRMP communication

- ERAS applicant to our advanced program (currently she is a PGY1) is in an ER residency
- We interviewed her but did not rank her
- We are later informed that we've committed a match violation
- We were actually interviewing her for her PGY3 year...
- After much letter writing, violation is voided

### Question:

Is it a match violation to switch specialties?

### Two Issues:

- Talking to, interviewing a matched applicant
  - What is the reason?
  - Is this fair in a free society?
- ERAS applications don't tell us this is a matched applicant... And thus signify that a release from the NRMP is needed
- Need to go to the R3 system on the NRMP website

### Love Relationships

- We had a medical student who matched with us for the advanced program
- During internship in another part of the country fell in love and wanted to stay there for residency
- Was unable to get a waiver from the NRMP even though both programs supported it
- Why no waiver?

### Love Relationship

- Mr. Jones is a 4<sup>th</sup> year medical student
- He matches his PGY1 yr in New York and his CA1 (advanced) residency in California
- During his internship, he meets, falls in love and gets engaged with Dr. Smith
- Dr. Smith is matched to a categorical OB-GYN residency in New York
- Drs. Jones and Smith want to be together

### Scenario continued

- They decide it is in their best interest for Dr. Jones to seek a venue change for his advanced training. He considers many excellent programs
- He contacts many NY programs who all say:
  - “you need to receive a release/waiver from your matched program in California”
  - “you need to receive a release/waiver from the NRMP”

### Scenario Continued

- Dr. Jones receives a release from his California program
- The NRMP releases the California program from their obligation to Dr. Jones
- The NRMP denies Dr. Jones his request for a waiver and informs him he cannot accept a position in an NRMP match-participating program for 1 year
- Any interviewing by a NY program prior to Dr. Jones receiving his NRMP-waiver is a violation

### NRMP Waivers to Applicants:

- Granted for “serious hardships”:
  - “Highly unusual circumstances”
  - “Unexpected and unpredictable situations”
  - eg. “death or serious illness of a family member”
  - eg. “loss of accreditation by the program”

### Love Relationships:

- What is the thinking of the NRMP around these events?
- Why are 2-4 years of separation not considered “serious hardships”?

### Out-of-match offers:

- A resident is finishing her pediatric residency
- Is applying through the match, but is not obligated (by her current position) to the match
- Is offered a contract prior to the match
- Is this a match violation?